

Maxed Out

New York City School Overcrowding Crisis

Table of Contents

**Report prepared by:
The Campaign for Fiscal Equity, Inc.
May 2009**



TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	1
Major Findings	2
New School Construction	4
Reallocation of Underutilized Space	5
“Natural” Declines in Enrollment	5
Summary of Recommendations	6
Methodology	11
METHODOLOGY	13
Overview	13
Data Sources	14
Approach to Analysis	20
How the Schools Are Chosen	20
Analyzing and Calculating Existing Overcrowding Conditions	21
SINI/SRAP Schools in Overcrowded School Buildings	22
Analyzing Historical Enrollment in Overcrowded Buildings and Buildings with Temporary Spaces	22
Analyzing the Age of Temporary Structures	23
Overcrowding in New School Buildings	23
Potential Impact of Enrollment Projections on Overcrowding	24
Underutilized School Buildings	24
Capital Plan Impact on Overcrowding	25
FINDINGS	27
Overcrowded School Buildings	28
School Buildings with Utilization Rates greater than 100%	28
Enrollment in Overcrowded School Buildings	30
Overcrowded School Buildings – Levels of Overcrowding	34
School Buildings with Utilization Rates between 100% and 110%	35
School Buildings with Utilization Rates between 110% and 125%	37
School Buildings with Utilization Rates between 125% and 150%	39
School Buildings with Utilization Rates greater than 150%	41
Impact of Overcrowding Levels on Number of Students	43
Overcrowded School Buildings with Enrollments over 1,000	44
School Buildings with Utilization Rates between 90% and 100%	48
School Buildings with Temporary Structures	51
Multiple Temporary Structures at Individual School Buildings	54
Overcrowded School Buildings with Temporary Structures	54
School Buildings with Temporary Structures Levels of Overcrowding	57
Low Performing Schools in Overcrowded School Buildings	65
2007-08 SINI/SRAP Schools	65

Low Performing Schools in School Buildings with Temporary Structures	67
Historical Capacity of Overcrowded School Buildings from 1997 to 2007	70
School Buildings with Utilization Rates greater than 100% for Ten Years.....	70
School Buildings with Utilization Rates above 90% for Ten Years	73
School Buildings with Temporary Structures with Utilization Rates greater than 100% for Ten Years.....	75
School Buildings with Temporary Structures with Utilization Rates greater than 90% for Ten Years	77
Overcrowded School Buildings for Each of Ten Years Utilizing Historical Capacity Data Only.....	79
School Buildings with Increasing Overcrowding over 10 Years.....	82
School Buildings with Decreasing Overcrowding over 10 Years	83
Overcrowding in 2001-02 and 2006-07	83
Ten Year History of Temporary Structures.....	86
Overcrowding in New School Buildings.....	89
DOE's Enrollment Projections for 2007 to 2016.....	90
Potential Impact on Overcrowding.....	90
Potential Mitigation Strategies to Overcrowding.....	102
Underutilized School Buildings.....	102
Potential Capital Plan Impact	104
On Overcrowded School Buildings.....	104
On Enrollment Projections and New Capacity Projects.....	106
Potential Impact of Enrollment Projections and New Capacity Projects on Temporary Structures	108
RECOMMENDATIONS.....	111
1. The DOE Capital Plan must prioritize eliminating school overcrowding in the highest priority schools.....	111
2. Plans for new schools must target urgent overcrowding problems.....	113
3. Capital Plan timelines should be re-examined to prevent back loading of urgently needed projects.....	114
4. Projected declines in enrollment should not be relied upon to solve overcrowding.....	115
5. DOE must do a better job to target under-utilized space to combat overcrowding.	115
6. Plans to combat overcrowding must address temporary structures.....	116
7. DOE must develop a long-term strategy to eliminate all overcrowding.	117

APPENDIX	119
Table 1: 391 OVERCROWDED SCHOOL BUILDINGS.....	119
Table 2: 215 SCHOOL BUILDINGS AND 252 TEMPORARY STRUCTURES.....	129
Table 3: 91 OVERCROWDED SCHOOL BUILDINGS WITH TEMPORARY STRUCTURES - LIST OF BUILDINGS BY DISTRICT & BOROUGH	W
Table 4: 91 OVERCROWDED SCHOOL BUILDINGS WITH TEMPORARY STRUCTURES - ENROLLMENT BY SCHOOL LEVEL, DISTRICT & BOROUGH.....	139
Table 5: 391 OVERCROWDED SCHOOL BUILDINGS - NUMBER BY SCHOOL LEVEL, UTILIZATION RANGE & BOROUGH.....	140
Table 6: OVERCROWDED ELEMENTARY SCHOOL BUILDINGS - BY DISTRICT & BOROUGH	W
Table 7: OVERCROWDED MIDDLE SCHOOL BUILDINGS - BY DISTRICT & BOROUGH	W
Table 8: 391 OVERCROWDED SCHOOL BUILDINGS - NUMBER BY SCHOOL LEVEL, UTILIZATION RANGE, DISTRICT & BOROUGH.....	141
Table 9: OVERCROWDED HIGH SCHOOL BUILDINGS - BY DISTRICT & BOROUGH.....	W
Table 10: 391 OVERCROWDED SCHOOL BUILDINGS - COMPARISON OF OVERCROWDED BUILDINGS & TOTAL NUMBER OF BUILDINGS BY DISTRICT & BOROUGH	145
Table 11: 391 OVERCROWDED SCHOOL BUILDINGS - ENROLLMENT BY DISTRICT, UTILIZATION RANGE & BOROUGH	146
Table 12: ELEMENTARY & MIDDLE SCHOOL ENROLLMENT - PERCENTAGE OF OVERCROWDING BY DISTRICT.....	150
Table 13: HIGH SCHOOL ENROLLMENT -PERCENTAGE OF OVERCROWDING BY DISTRICT/BOROUGH	151
Table 14: DISTRICT/BOROUGH ENROLLMENT - PERCENTAGE OF OVERCROWDING FOR ALL SCHOOL LEVELS	152
Table 15: OVERCROWDED SCHOOL BUILDINGS - UTILIZATION BETWEEN 100% & 110% BY BOROUGH & DISTRICT	W
Table 16: OVERCROWDED SCHOOL BUILDINGS - NUMBER OF BUILDINGS BY SCHOOL LEVELS, UTILIZATION RANGE & BOROUGH.....	153
Table 17: OVERCROWDED SCHOOL BUILDINGS - ENROLLMENT BY UTILIZATION RANGE & BOROUGH.....	154
Table 18: OVERCROWDED SCHOOL BUILDINGS - UTILIZATION BETWEEN 110% & 125% BY DISTRICT & BOROUGH	W
Table 19: OVERCROWDED SCHOOL BUILDINGS - UTILIZATION BETWEEN 125% & 150% BY DISTRICT & BOROUGH	155
Table 20: OVERCROWDED SCHOOL BUILDINGS - UTILIZATION GREATER THAN 150% BY HIGHEST UTILIZATION.....	W
Table 21: OVERCROWDED SCHOOL BUILDINGS - UTILIZATION GREATER THAN 150% BY DISTRICT & BOROUGH	W
Table 22: OVERCROWDED SCHOOL BUILDINGS - ENROLLMENT BY BOROUGH & LEVEL OF UTILIZATION	158
Table 23: OVERCROWDED SCHOOL BUILDINGS WITH MORE THAN 1,000 STUDENTS - ORGANIZED BY HIGHEST ENROLLMENT.....	W
Table 24: OVERCROWDED SCHOOL BUILDINGS WITH MORE THAN 1000 STUDENTS - NUMBER OF BUILDINGS BY SCHOOL LEVEL, DISTRICT& BOROUGH	159
Table 25: OVERCROWDED SCHOOL BUILDINGS WITH MORE THAN 1,000 STUDENTS - ENROLLMENT BY SCHOOL LEVEL, DISTRICT AND BOROUGH.....	160
Table 26: OVERCROWDED SCHOOL BUILDINGS WITH MORE THAN 1,000 STUDENTS & OVER CAPACITY BY MORE THAN 300 STUDENTS.....	161
Table 27: OVERCROWDED SCHOOL BUILDINGS WITH MORE THAN 1000 STUDENTS & OVER CAPACITY BY MORE THAN 300 STUDENTS - ENROLLMENT BY SCHOOL LEVEL, DISTRICT & BOROUGH	162
Table 28: 169 SCHOOL BUILDINGS WITH UTILIZATIONS BETWEEN 90% & 100%.....	W

Table 29: SCHOOL BUILDINGS WITH UTILIZATION BETWEEN 90% & 100% - NUMBER OF BUILDINGS BY SCHOOL LEVEL, DISTRICT & BOROUGH.....	163
Table 30: SCHOOL BUILDINGS WITH UTILIZATION BETWEEN 90% & 100% - ENROLLMENT BY SCHOOL LEVEL, DISTRICT & BOROUGH.....	164
Table 31: SCHOOL BUILDINGS WITH TEMPORARY STRUCTURES WITH UTILIZATION GREATER THAN 90% - ENROLLMENT BY SCHOOL LEVEL, DISTRICT & BOROUGH.....	165
Table 32: 215 SCHOOL BUILDINGS WITH TEMPORARY STRUCTURES - NUMBER OF BUILDINGS BY SCHOOL LEVEL, DISTRICT & BOROUGH.....	169
Table 33: 252 TEMPORARY STRUCTURES - NUMBER BY SCHOOL LEVEL, DISTRICT & BOROUGH.....	170
Table 34: 215 SCHOOL BUILDINGS WITH TEMPORARY STRUCTURES - ENROLLMENT IN MAIN BUILDINGS BY SCHOOL LEVEL, DISTRICT, BOROUGH & UTILIZATION RATES.....	171
Table 35: 252 TEMPORARY STRUCTURES - ENROLLMENT IN MAIN BUILDINGS BY SCHOOL LEVEL, DISTRICT, BOROUGH & UTILIZATION RATES.....	175
Table 36: 31 MAIN BUILDINGS WITH MULTIPLE TEMPORARY STRUCTURES.....	179
Table 37: 31 SCHOOL BUILDINGS WITH MULTIPLE TEMPORARY STRUCTURES - BY SCHOOL LEVEL, DISTRICT & BOROUGH.....	182
Table 38: 91 OVERCROWDED SCHOOL BUILDINGS WITH TEMPORARY STRUCTURES - COMPARISON OF OVERCROWDED BUILDINGS & TOTAL NUMBER OF BUILDINGS WITH TEMPORARY STRUCTURES BY DISTRICT & BOROUGH.....	183
Table 39: 91 OVERCROWDED SCHOOL BUILDINGS WITH TEMPORARY STRUCTURES - NUMBER OF BUILDINGS BY SCHOOL LEVEL, DISTRICT & BOROUGH.....	184
Table 40: SCHOOL BUILDINGS WITH TEMPORARY STRUCTURES WITH UTILIZATION GREATER THAN 90%.....	W
Table 41: TEMPORARY STRUCTURES ASSOCIATED WITH MAIN BUILDINGS WITH UTILIZATION GREATER THAN 90%.....	W
Table 42: 133 SCHOOL BUILDINGS WITH TEMPORARY STRUCTURES WITH UTILIZATIONS GREATER THAN 90% - NUMBER BY SCHOOL LEVEL.....	185
Table 43: 133 SCHOOL BUILDINGS WITH TEMPORARY STRUCTURES WITH UTILIZATIONS GREATER THAN 90% - ENROLLMENT OF MAIN BUILDINGS BY SCHOOL LEVEL, UTILIZATION RANGE & BOROUGH.....	186
Table 44: TEMPORARY STRUCTURES OF MAIN BUILDINGS WITH UTILIZATION RATES GREATER THAN 90% - ENROLLMENT BY SCHOOL LEVEL, UTILIZATION LEVEL & BOROUGH.....	187
Table 45: SCHOOL BUILDINGS WITH TEMPORARY STRUCTURES WITH UTILIZATIONS GREATER THAN 90% - NUMBER BY SCHOOL LEVEL, UTILIZATION RANGE & DISTRICT.....	188
Table 46: SCHOOL BUILDINGS WITH TEMPORARY STRUCTURES BOTH WITH UTILIZATIONS GREATER THAN 90%.....	W
Table 47: SCHOOL BUILDINGS & TEMPORARY STRUCTURES BOTH WITH UTILIZATION RATES GREATER THAN 90% - NUMBER BY DISTRICT & BOROUGH.....	191
Table 48: SCHOOL BUILDINGS WITH TEMPORARY STRUCTURES WITH ENROLLMENT GREATER THAN 1,000.....	W
Table 49: SCHOOL BUILDINGS & TEMPORARY STRUCTURES GREATER THAN 1,000 - BY SCHOOL LEVEL, DISTRICT & BOROUGH.....	192
Table 50: OVERCROWDED SCHOOL BUILDINGS WITH TEMPORARY STRUCTURES - ENROLLMENT GREATER THAN 1,000 WITH MORE THAN 300 STUDENTS OVER CAPACITY.....	W
Table 51: OVERCROWDED SINI/SRAP SCHOOLS ON THE 2007/08 LIST.....	193
Table 52: OVERCROWDED SINI/SRAP SCHOOLS ON THE 2006/2007 LIST.....	196
Table 53: SINI/SRAP SCHOOLS WITH TEMPORARY STRUCTURES ON THE 2007/08 LIST.....	199
Table 54: SINI/SRAP SCHOOLS WITH TEMPORARY STRUCTURES ON THE 2006/2007 LIST.....	203
Table 55: OVERCROWDED SCHOOL BUILDINGS FROM TABLE 1 THAT ARE OVERCROWDED FOR 10 YEARS (USING HISTORICAL CAPACITY).....	W
Table 56: OVERCROWDED SCHOOL BUILDINGS FROM TABLE 2 THAT ARE OVERCROWDED FOR 10 YEARS (USING HISTORICAL CAPACITY).....	W

Table 57: OVERCROWDED SCHOOL BUILDINGS FOR 10 YEARS BASED ON HISTORICAL CAPACITY FOR ALL 10 YEARS.....	W
Table 58: OVERCROWDED SCHOOL BUILDINGS FROM TABLE 1 THAT ARE OVERCROWDED FOR 10 YEARS (USING HISTORICAL CAPACITY) - NUMBER BY SCHOOL LEVEL, DISTRICT & BOROUGH.....	206
Table 59: OVERCROWDED SCHOOL BUILDINGS FROM TABLE 1 THAT ARE OVERCROWDED FOR 10 YEARS (USING HISTORICAL CAPACITY) - ENROLLMENT BY SCHOOL LEVEL, DISTRICT & BOROUGH.....	207
Table 60: OVERCROWDED SCHOOL BUILDINGS BASED ON TABLE 1 WITH UTILIZATION GREATER THAN 90% FOR 10 YEARS	W
Table 61: SCHOOL BUILDINGS BASED ON TABLE 1 WITH UTILIZATION GREATER THAN 90% FOR 10 YEARS (USING HISTORICAL CAPACITY) - NUMBER BY SCHOOL LEVEL, DISTRICT & BOROUGH	208
Table 62: SCHOOL BUILDINGS BASED ON TABLE 1 WITH UTILIZATION GREATER THAN 90% FOR 10 YEARS - ENROLLMENT BY SCHOOL LEVEL, DISTRICT & BOROUGH.....	209
Table 63: SCHOOL BUILDINGS WITH TEMPORARY SPACES BASED ON REPORT 2 - MAIN BUILDINGS WITH UTILIZATION GREATER THAN 90% FOR 10 YEARS USING HISTORICAL CAPACITY	W
Table 64: SCHOOL BUILDINGS WITH TEMPORARY STRUCTURES BASED ON TABLE 2 - MAIN BUILDINGS WITH UTILIZATION GREATER THAN 90% FOR 10 YEARS (USING HISTORICAL CAPACITY).....	W
Table 65: SCHOOL BUILDINGS WITH UTILIZATION RATES GREATER THAN 90% FOR 10 YEARS BASED ON HISTORICAL CAPACITY FOR ALL 10 YEARS.....	W
Table 66: OVERCROWDED SCHOOL BUILDINGS BASED ON REPORT #1 WITH INCREASING UTILIZATION OVER 10 YEARS.....	210
Table 67: OVERCROWDED SCHOOL BUILDINGS BASED ON REPORT #1 WITH DECREASING UTILIZATION OVER 10 YEARS.....	212
Table 68: SCHOOL BUILDINGS WITH UTILIZATION RATES GREATER THAN 90% IN 2006/07 (USING HISTORICAL CAPACITY) - NUMBER OF BUILDINGS BY SCHOOL LEVEL, UTILIZATION RANGE & BOROUGH.....	214
Table 69: SCHOOL BUILDINGS WITH UTILIZATION RATES GREATER THAN 90% IN 2006/07 (USING HISTORICAL CAPACITY) - ENROLLMENT BY SCHOOL LEVEL, UTILIZATION RANGE & BOROUGH.....	215
Table 70: SCHOOL BUILDINGS WITH UTILIZATION RATES GREATER THAN 90% IN 2001/02 (USING HISTORICAL CAPACITY) - NUMBER OF BUILDINGS BY SCHOOL LEVEL, UTILIZATION RANGE & BOROUGH.....	216
Table 71: SCHOOL BUILDINGS WITH UTILIZATION GREATER THAN 90% IN 2001/02 USING HISTORICAL CAPACITY - ENROLLMENT BY SCHOOL LEVEL, UTILIZATION RANGE & BOROUGH.....	217
Table 72: 252 TEMPORARY STRUCTURES - 10 YEAR HISTORY BY DISTRICT & BOROUGH	W
Table 73: 252 TEMPORARY STRUCTURES - SUMMARY OF 10 YEAR HISTORY BY DISTRICT & BOROUGH.....	218
Table 74: OVERCROWDED NEW SCHOOL BUILDINGS.....	219
Table 75: ENROLLMENT PROJECTIONS IN 2011 & 2016 BASED ON GRIER & STATISTICAL FORECASTING REPORTS	223
Table 76: ENROLLMENT PROJECTIONS FOR OVERCROWDED SCHOOL BUILDINGS IN TABLE 1 IN 2011 & 2016 BY DISTRICT.....	224
Table 77: ENROLLMENT PROJECTIONS FOR TEMPORARY STRUCTURES IN TABLE 2 IN 2011 & 2016 BY DISTRICT.....	226
Table 78: ENROLLMENT PROJECTIONS FOR SCHOOL BUILDINGS WITH TEMPORARY STRUCTURES IN TABLE 2 IN 2011 & 2016 BY DISTRICT	228
Table 79: ENROLLMENT PROJECTIONS FOR SCHOOL BUILDINGS IN TABLE 2 & TEMPORARY STRUCTURES CONSOLIDATED - GRIER REPORT	230
Table 80: ENROLLMENT PROJECTIONS FOR SCHOOL BUILDINGS IN TABLE 2 & TEMPORARY STRUCTURES CONSOLIDATED - STATISTICAL FORECASTING REPORT.....	232
Table 81: SCHOOL BUILDINGS WITH UTILIZATION RATES BETWEEN 50% & 75% IN 2006/2007.....	W

Table 82: SCHOOL BUILDINGS WITH UTILIZATION RATES BELOW 50% IN 2006/2007	W
Table 83: SCHOOL BUILDINGS WITH UTILIZATION RATES BETWEEN 50% & 75% FOR 10 YEARS	W
Table 84: SCHOOL BUILDINGS WITH UTILIZATION RATES BETWEEN 50% & 75% IN 2006/07 - NUMBER OF BUILDINGS BY SCHOOL LEVEL, DISTRICT & BOROUGH.....	234
Table 85: SCHOOL BUILDINGS WITH UTILIZATION RATES BELOW 50% IN 2006/07 - NUMBER OF BUILDINGS BY SCHOOL LEVEL, DISTRICT & BOROUGH.....	235
Table 86: IMPACT OF RECENTLY COMPLETED & NEW CAPACITY UNDERWAY ON OVERCROWDED SCHOOL BUILDINGS IN TABLE 1 USING 2006/07 TARGETED CAPACITY	236
Table 87: IMPACT OF NEW CAPACITY - RECENTLY COMPLETED, UNDERWAY & PROPOSED — ON OVERCROWDED SCHOOL BUILDINGS IN TABLE 1 USING 2006/07 TARGETED CAPACITY.....	237
Table 88: IMPACT OF GRIER REPORT'S ENROLLMENT PROJECTIONS IN 2011 & 2016 AND NEW CAPACITY ON OVERCROWDED SCHOOL BUILDINGS IN TABLE 1	239
Table 89: IMPACT OF STATISTICAL FORECASTING REPORT'S ENROLLMENT PROJECTIONS IN 2011 & 2016 AND NEW CAPACITY ON OVERCROWDED BUILDINGS IN TABLE 1	241
Table 90: IMPACT OF GRIER REPORT'S ENROLLMENT PROJECTIONS IN 2016 AND AVAILABLE NEW CAPACITY ON THE NEED FOR TEMPORARY STRUCTURES.....	243
Table 91: IMPACT OF STATISTICAL FORECASTING REPORT'S ENROLLMENT PROJECTIONS IN 2016 & AVAILABLE NEW CAPACITY ON THE NEED FOR TEMPORARY STRUCTURES.....	245
Table 92: HIGHEST PRIORITY SCHOOL BUILDINGS	247
Table 93: PRIORITY SCHOOL BUILDINGS	250